

Title: Verdelot and Arcadelt : Chanson, Madrigal, and National Style

Author(s): Kate van Orden

Source: *Das italienische Madrigal : Alfred Einsteins »Versuch einer Geschichte der italienischen Profanmusik im 16. Jahrhundert« und die Folgen*, ed. by Sebastian Bolz, Moritz Kelber, Katelijne Schiltz; Dresden, musiconn.publish 2025, (= troja. Jahrbuch für Renaissancemusik 20), p. 279–292.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.25371/troja.v20223944>

Creative Commons license: CC BY-SA



Vorliegende Publikation wird unter obengenannter CC-Lizenz durch musiconn.publish im Open Access bereitgestellt.

musiconn.publish dient der kostenfreien elektronischen Publikation, dem Nachweis und der langfristigen Archivierung von musikwissenschaftlicher Fachliteratur. Auch Arbeiten aus der Musikpädagogik und der Künstlerischen Forschung mit Musikbezug sind willkommen. Außerdem bietet musiconn.publish die Möglichkeit zur digitalen Publikation von wissenschaftlichen Noteneditionen.

musiconn.publish ist ein Service des Fachinformationsdienstes Musikwissenschaft (musiconn – für vernetzte Musikwissenschaft), der von der Deutschen Forschungsgemeinschaft gefördert und gemeinschaftlich von der Sächsischen Landesbibliothek – Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek Dresden und der Bayerischen Staatsbibliothek München betrieben wird.

Weitere Informationen zu musiconn.publish finden Sie hier: <https://musiconn.qucosa.de/>

Eine Übersicht zu allen Services von musiconn finden Sie hier: <https://www.musiconn.de/>

Das italienische Madrigal.
Alfred Einsteins »Versuch einer Geschichte
der italienischen Profanmusik im 16. Jahrhundert«
und die Folgen

Herausgegeben von
Sebastian Bolz, Moritz Kelber und Katelijne Schiltz

Die Tagung im Jahr 2022, auf die dieser Band zurückgeht, und diese Publikation erfuhren großzügige Unterstützung. Wir danken herzlich unseren Förderern:



Eine Veröffentlichung von musiconn.publish –
dem Open-Access-Repository für Musikwissenschaft

Sächsische Landesbibliothek –
Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek Dresden
Zellescher Weg 18
01069 Dresden



© 2025 Autor*innen

Die Inhalte dieses Werks werden unter der Creative-Commons-Lizenz CC BY-SA 4.0 DE zur Verfügung gestellt. Hiervon ausgenommen ist das Bildmaterial, das ggf. abweichenden, in den Bildlegenden spezifizierten Bestimmungen unterliegt.



Layout: Sebastian Bolz und Moritz Kelber
Cover: Moritz Kelber

ISSN: 2513-1028

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.25371/troja.v2022>

Inhalt

Sebastian Bolz, Moritz Kelber, Katelijne Schiltz Vorwort	9
Abkürzungen	18
Sebastian Bolz Alfred Einsteins <i>Das italienische Madrigal</i> . Zur Entstehung eines musikwissenschaftlichen Buchs	19
Anna Magdalena Bredenbach Das Madrigal erzählen. Alfred Einsteins Gattungsgeschichte in narratologischer Perspektive	73
Katelijne Schiltz Alfred Einstein, <i>The Italian Madrigal</i> and Analogies of the Ages	101
Benjamin Ory Alfred Einstein's Scholarship, the Italian Madrigal, and <i>The Italian Madrigal</i>	123
Moritz Kelber Concepts of Nationality and Migration in Alfred Einstein's <i>The Italian Madrigal</i>	139
Laurie Stras Singing Madrigals: On the Aesthetics of Singing in Einstein's <i>The Italian Madrigal</i>	159
Christian Thomas Leitmeir Ein Riese auf Schultern von Zwergen? Einstein im Rekurs auf Forschungstradition	181
Iain Fenlon Alfred Einstein: The Early Italian Madrigal Revisited	211

Philippe Canguilhem Einstein's Musical Sources: Building a History of the Italian Madrigal from the Prints	255
Giovanni Zanovello Einsteins Frottola und ihr Erbe	267
Kate van Orden Verdelot and Arcadelt: Chanson, Madrigal, and National Style	279
Bernhold Schmid »Eine[r] der grössten Meister aller Zeiten«. Orlando di Lassos Madrigale in Einsteins Sicht	293
Paul Schleuse »Dolcemente facendola finire«: Orazio Vecchi and Einstein's Endings	311
Florian Mehlretter Das Madrigal als literarische Gattung. Der Beitrag der Romanistik nach Einstein	323
Cristina Urchueguía Trotzige Noblesse: Einstein und seine Musikverleger. Ein Melodram	343
Cristina Urchueguía Alfred Einstein als Herausgeber: Eine Bibliographie	383
Henrike C. Lange Berkeley als geistige Lebensform: Alfred Einstein's Arrival in the Bay Area	393

Der vorliegende Band ergänzt und kommentiert
die deutschsprachige Erstausgabe des titelgebenden Werks:

Alfred Einstein, *Das italienische Madrigal.*
Versuch einer Geschichte der italienischen Profanmusik
im 16. Jahrhundert, hrsg. von Sebastian Bolz, München 2025
(Münchner Veröffentlichungen zur Musikgeschichte, 83)

Die Edition von Einsteins Text ist digital verfügbar:

DOI: 10.5282/ubm/epub.128701 (PDF)

DOI: 10.5282/ubm/data.691 (TEI, MEI)

Kate van Orden

Verdelot and Arcadelt: Chanson, Madrigal, and National Style¹

The Italian Language and Italian Nationalism

To read *The Italian Madrigal* is to plunge into an analytic world that is distinctive for its attention to language. As Einstein says in his preface, »what is most important, the history of an art-form in which poetry and music are one is possible only on the basis of a knowledge of music and poetry, of poetry and music«.² A quick glance at the table of contents illustrates the ways that literary criticism animates huge swaths of Einstein's book: Chapter II is dominated by a forty-five page introduction to the poets and poetry of early madrigal verse titled »The Madrigal and Poetry«, whereas Chapter I, on »Antecedents«, provides an exhaustive taxonomy of poetic forms in the frottola repertoire in sections on »The Strambotto«, »The Oda«, »Latin Texts«, »The Capitolo«, »The Sonnet«, and »The Canzone«. This chapter closes with Einstein's well-known argument concerning »The Return to Literary Standards«, in which he posits that the influence of Petrarchism was felt in musical circles, where it enhanced the literary quality of Italian secular song, transforming frottola into madrigal.³ This is just one example of the

1 With many thanks to Sebastian Bolz, Moritz Kelber, and Katelijne Schiltz for organizing a conference that gave all of us an opportunity to come back to a book that has occupied such a sizeable place in our field. I would also like to thank all the participants for the robust discussions, which contributed so much to my thinking; special thanks go to Philippe Canguilhem for sharing his forthcoming research on Arcadelt, and Pedro Memelsdorff, Francesco Spagnolo, and Richard Wistreich for their invaluable feedback on an earlier draft of this essay.

2 *TIM*, p. vi.

3 Iain Fenlon and James Haar, *The Italian Madrigal in the Early Sixteenth Century. Sources and Interpretation*, Cambridge 1988, pp. 5–14, give an excellent review of scholarship adopting a »frottola-into-madrigal« thesis, which, in addition to Einstein, includes: Walter Rubsamen's »From Frottola to Madrigal: The Changing Pattern of Secular Italian Vocal music«, *Chanson and Madrigal, 1480–1530: Studies in Comparison and Contrast*, ed. James Haar, Cambridge, MA 1964, pp. 51–87.

cause-effect relationships Einstein observes between evolutions in poetic taste and developments in secular music.

It may seem self-evident that Italian literary history would be central to any full account of the Italian madrigal, but coming back to Einstein after all these years, I am struck by the specific ways in which Italian anchors the narrative. By »Italian« I mean the literary language of Petrarch, Boccaccio, and Dante that was promoted by Pietro Bembo and others in the *questione della lingua* debates of the 1520s. But I also mean the longer history of the Italian language as it was codified by the Accademia della Crusca and the publication of its *Vocabolario* in 1612.⁴ Despite being highly artificial, these linguistic initiatives were remarkably successful, and they effectively created a national literary language centuries before the political unification of Italy in 1861.⁵ Reading Einstein, I see the rise of literary Italian operating as a tacit model for the rise of the madrigal as a national genre of secular song. And one striking result of this linking of poetry and music is that the proto-nationalism built into literary histories of the *tre corone* and the victory of Tuscan as standard Italian spins off into a musical corollary that is equally nationalistic, if not more so.

This conjoining of linguistic and musical ideologies begins in the opening pages of *The Italian Madrigal* as Einstein charts the Italian struggle to develop and consolidate a national musical style. What began with the appearance of »a new indigenous Italian music« around 1500 and a »quiet revolution« in literary taste around 1520 culminates – in his telling – in the »complete victory of the Italian national style« at century's end.⁶ Initially, this struggle takes place within the Italian peninsula, as native composers rise up and take control of their musical destiny. But ultimately, in a century Einstein characterizes as one of growing nationalism, Italians win »world leadership« and the Italian madrigal »penetrates Elizabethan England, conquering it at the first assault.«⁷ The gendered violence energizing that remark adds sexual assault to Einstein's cocktail of military met-

4 Accademia della Crusca, *Vocabolario degli Accademici della Crusca, con tre indici delle voci, locuzioni, e proverbi latini, e greci, posti per entro l'opera*, Venice 1612.

5 For an overview, see Brian Richardson, »Questions of Language«, *The Cambridge Companion to Modern Italian Culture*, ed. Zygmunt G. Baranski and Rebecca J. West, Cambridge 2001, pp. 63–79.

6 *TIM*, pp. 3 f.

7 *Ibid.*, p. 4. See also the German original in *DIM*, S. 2 f.: »eine Auseinandersetzung, die immer mehr zum Ausgleich wird und mit dem vollen Sieg des nationalen italienischen Stils endigt«; »Ungefähr 150 Jahre später, um 1580 dringt das italienische Madrigal, die italienische »Canzone da ballo« nach der elisabethanischen Insel, reißt sie im ersten Ansturm bis zu bedingungsloser Hingabe«. It is worth noting that the original German is less violent than the English translation (i.e., »Hingabe« [abandon] rather than »Aufgabe« [surrender]); there is also no penetration in the German (»dringt zu«, not »dringt ein«). Also see the section titled »The Century of Growing Nationalism«, vol. 1, pp. 28 f.

aphors, casting the Italian madrigal as the conquering hero that – by century's end – will rule the world.⁸

It is hard to square the combativeness of Einstein's writing with the impact of war on his life and family. A German-Jewish musicologist born in 1880 and educated in Munich, when the National Socialists seized power in 1933, Einstein was well-launched in his career, living in Berlin and working as the music critic of the *Berliner Tageblatt* and editor-in-chief of the *Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft*.⁹ He was swiftly removed from both positions, and he and his family relocated first to London in 1933, and then to Mezzomonte, Italy in 1935, where – thanks to the financial resources of his wife – he was able to carry out extensive research for *The Italian Madrigal*. But by 1938, life in Mussolini's Italy had become unsafe, and the Einsteins were forced to move again, this time to the United States.¹⁰ It is possible that Einstein employed violent rhetoric for the power it imparted to his prose, but it does seem striking that someone who had lived in London not long before its decimation by the Blitz of 1940–1941 would write so casually about a quick and victorious assault on England or, for that matter, any form of nationalism turned imperialistic, musical or political.

Indeed, why speak of nation at all when writing of the Cinquecento, when »Italy« was a patchwork of city-states, Papal states, duchies, and maritime republics? In Einstein's nativist history of the Italian madrigal, national style is a device contrived to counter the internationalism of Italian chapels at the time. And so, foreigners become major players in its narrative of struggle, an invading force that arrived in the fifteenth century, when »French-Burgundian musicians [...] usurped the entire domain of artistic music throughout the Italian peninsula«, where »there was no native school« and »no native genius«. ¹¹ Later, in the early

8 For other prominent uses of military metaphors in volume I, see *TIM*, pp. 16 f., 151, 448.

9 Martin Geck, »Einstein, Alfred«, *MGG Online* (2016).

10 For an exhibition that examined the last years of Einstein's life, in El Cerrito, CA, and included items drawn from his personal archives (now at the Jean Gray Hargrove Music Library of the University of California, Berkeley), see »Saved by The Bay: The Intellectual Migration from Fascist Europe to UC Berkeley«, curated by Francesco Spagnolo with Elena Kempf, undergraduate curatorial apprentice, The Magnes Collection of Jewish Art and Life, University of California, Berkeley, <https://magnes.berkeley.edu/exhibitions/past-exhibitions/savedbythebay-2/>.

11 *TIM*, p. 17. Pedro Memelsdorff, »Echi d'influenze pirrottiane in sessant'anni di ricerca musicologica«, *Musicologia fra due continenti: Peredità di Nino Pirrotta: convegno internazionale, Roma, 4–6 giugno 2008*, Rome 2010 (Atti dei convegni lincei, 259), pp. 187–210: pp. 188–198, observes that Nino Pirrotta employs similar formulations in his description of the manuscript Modena A in an article begun in 1938 and published in 1946 (»Il codice Estense lat. 568 e la musica francese in Italia al principio del 1400«, *Atti della Reale Accademia di scienze, lettere e arti di Palermo*, ser. 4, 5/2 [1946], pp. 5–58). Memelsdorff discusses Pirrotta's characterization of French-texted songs set by Italians in the style of Ars subtilior as »penetrazione dell'arte polifonica francese in Italia« and »l'apparente infirmarsi del prestigio e la vitalità della tradizione polifonica italiana trecentesca, pronta a cedere

sixteenth century, »the essentially monodic art of the Italians« was infused with »a polyphonic art of unsurpassable greatness and mastery, an art represented in Italy by the great musicians from beyond the Alps.«¹²

In its broadest strokes, this is the old story of the Renaissance itself, with its meeting of Franco-Flemish polyphonic technique and Italian humanism, retold in micro for the sixteenth century. But whereas standard accounts of the fifteenth-century musical Renaissance tend to favor Latin-texted genres like the motet, Einstein's subject forces the vernacular to center stage, with some very powerful results. Against the backdrop of pan-European styles of polyphony that emerged with the long-distance circulation of music and musicians through ecclesiastical networks, Einstein finds himself confronted with issues of vernacular language and (proto)national identity. In short, the Italian madrigal defies simplistic definition as a national genre when it was developed by *oltremontani* like Philippe Verdelot and Jacques Arcadelt and when its style overlaps with that of the French chanson.

Before turning to Einstein's treatment of Verdelot and Arcadelt, we might first note how the French chanson emerges as a principal antagonist in Einstein's scenario. Confronted with the conundrum of an »Artistic Pause« following the publication of Bernardo Pisano's *Musica* of 1520, Einstein finds one explanation in the »infiltration« into Italy of French chansons from the presses of Pierre Attaignant.¹³ South of the Alps, chansons contribute to the »confusion and disorder that prevail in Italian secular music around 1530 and the lack of direction on the part of the publishers and printers, who are no longer sure of the demands of their own public.«¹⁴ Einstein rails against the mix of motets, canzoni, villotte, and chansons in books like the *Libro primo de la fortuna* of c. 1526, and his sense of frustration is palpable. Doubtless this impression of confusion was exacerbated by his having consulted the lone remaining Altus partbook in the Civico Museo in Bologna, shelfmark R.141, where the miscellaneous aspect is amplified across the tract volume in which the *Libro primo de la fortuna* is bound with books containing motets, *canzoni francesi*, and *canzoni profane in volgare*.

Einstein's antipathy toward the mixing of vernacular genres is pronounced, as is his desire to resolve these entanglements, which he clearly views as negatives. Some of this doubtless relates to the intellectual climate of Einstein's formative years, when national musicological societies were first being launched, national

facilmente a una influenza straniera« (ibid., pp. 5 and 37). Memelsdorff also discusses the ways that Pirrotta's analysis reflects the ideological environment of the years in which he was writing.

12 *TIM*, p. 114.

13 Ibid., p. 139: »But there may be another reason for this cessation of secular production. I am thinking of the infiltration of the new French chanson into Italy.«

14 Ibid., p. 148.

musical editions like the *Denkmäler deutscher Tonkunst* and *Monuments de la musique française au temps de la renaissance* were in full swing, and nationalism exerted its centripetal force on the framing of history and research agendas. In Italy, the 1930s and 1940s saw the publication of a number of monuments of Italian music inspired by the German *Denkmäler* tradition, some from the state-sponsored presses of the Reale Accademia d'Italia.¹⁵ We should also remember that the years during which Einstein was living in Mezzomonte saw ever-increasing attention to language reform, which permeated most facets of Italian media, from newspapers that listed foreign words to be banned from usage to radio broadcasts and films that employed authorized pronunciation, and this is to say nothing of the campaign to abolish the »feminine, ungrammatical, and foreign« third person singular *Lei* as the polite form of address.¹⁶ These xenophobic initiatives designed to purify the Italian language and rid the country of foreign influences reached a zenith concurrent with the anti-Jewish laws that forced Einstein's departure in 1938.

Verdelot and Arcadelt as composers of French chansons

Against this violent backdrop of ethnic and linguistic cleansing, we might find it all the more impressive that Einstein chose to lean into the cultural, musical, and linguistic complexity of the 1520s and 1530s in his discussions of Verdelot and Arcadelt. His subject, after all, is the Italian madrigal, and yet he reckons at length with the Franco-Flemish identities of these two composers and their chansons, when he might just as well have set this subject aside. When the time comes to introduce them, he even attributes their destiny as madrigalists to their abilities as chanson composers, as though their musical DNA was optimally configured to allow them to resynthesize French chansons as madrigals once they landed on Italian soil:

»The first three masters of the madrigal were predestined for their work as creators by the twofold character of their artistic careers: Verdelot and Arcadelt were composers of chansons, Festa was a master of the motet.«¹⁷

Scholars of Verdelot's chansons will be surprised by Einstein's portrayal, since so few of Verdelot's chansons survive, and those that do are quite different from his

15 On Italian musicology in the 1920s and 1930s and the role of early music in constructing a national history of Italian music, see Iain Fenlon, »Malipiero, Monteverdi, Mussolini and Musicology«, *Sing, Ariel: Essays and Thoughts for Alexander Goehr's Seventieth Birthday*, ed. Alison Latham, Aldershot 2003, pp. 241–255, with information about the Reale Accademia d'Italia editions at p. 250.

16 See Alberto Raffielli, »Fascismo, lingua del«, *Enciclopedia dell'italiano* (2010), <https://www.treccani.it>.

17 *TIM*, p. 153.

madrigal settings.¹⁸ There is, in short, virtually no evidence of Verdelot having composed chansons, but Einstein remains undeterred, searching instead for traces of chansons in Verdelot's madrigals as he presses to establish Verdelot's »Frenchness« as a musician and the influence of the chanson on the early madrigal.

C. Dor - men - d'un

A. Dor - men - d'un gior - n'a

T. Dor - men - d'un gior - n'a Bai al - l'om -

S. Dor - men - d'un gior - n'a Bai al - l'om - br'A - mo - re,

B. Dor - men - d'un gior - n'a Bai al - l'om - br'A - mo - re,

gior - n'a Bai al - l'om - br'A - mo - re, Do - ve'l mor - mor

Bai al - l'om - br'A - mo - re, Do - ve'l mor - mor

- br'A - mo - re, Do - ve'l mor - mor

Dor - men - d'un gior - n'a Bai al - l'om - br'A - mo - re

Dor - men - d'un gior - n'a Bai al - l'om - br'A - mo - re

Ex. 1. Verdelot, *Dormend'un giorno*, reproduced from *TIM* 1, p. 255

Einstein's main example is Verdelot's five-voice madrigal *Dormend'un giorno*, which he describes as a »chanson in Italian« (see Example 1).¹⁹ »Verdelot«, he says,

18 Only three chansons have been attributed to Verdelot: *Seule demeure et despourvue*, 4vv, 1529²; *Et dont venés-vous Madame Lucette*, 4vv, 1535⁹; *Qui la dira la peine de mon cœur*, 8vv, 1572²; he also composed a Si placet fifth voice to Janequin's *La guerre*, 1545¹⁷.

19 *TIM*, p. 255. Here and in the following, I employ the spellings used by Einstein for both poetic texts and the names of composers.

»begins with five low voices in the manner of the anecdotal French chanson.«²⁰ It is unclear what Einstein means by »the anecdotal French chanson« (perhaps he is thinking of the programmatic chansons of Clément Janequin, some of which begin with points of imitation, or the popularesque chansons of Antoine Bruhier), but I agree that there is much of the chanson in this madrigal. Like the chansons of Claudin de Sermisy and Sandrin, Verdelot sets the text line by line with suspension cadences at the end of virtually every line, not just in this opening, but throughout the entire piece. Moreover, the tonality is crystal clear, as the cadences are all limited to G or D. Finally, the text is set with rhythms typical of the chanson of the 1520s, for instance, the classic opening dactyl used for »Dormend'un giorn'a«, as well as the repeated notes beginning on an offbeat employed for even numbered lines like »dove'l mormor« (m. 9). To be clear, though, this is my analysis, not Einstein's, as he does not mention any of these features. Rather, he reprints the lyrics and charts the musical repetitions that contribute to the chanson-like character of the setting with its opening repeat and closing refrain (the marginal indications of musical form in Table 1 are based on Einstein's analysis):

Musical Form	Text	Cadences
A	Dormend'un giorno a Bai all'ombra Amore	G
	Dove'l mormor de' fonti piu li piacque	D
A	Corser le ninf' a vendicar l'ardore	G
	E la face gli ascosen sotto l'acque.	D
B	Chi'l crederebbe: dentr' a quel liquore	D
	Subitament' eterno foco nacque,	G
	Ond'a quei bagni sempr'il caldo dura,	G
Refrain	Che la fiamma d'amor acqua non cura.	G

Tab. 1. Form of »Dormend'un giorno a Bai all'ombra Amore«

About the form, Einstein remarks:

»The second couplet takes the same music as the first, the remainder is treated as homophony, and made somewhat informal in its motifs and melismas; the final line is also repeated and supplied with a little coda. It is a chanson in Italian, simple and charming, providing it can be sung as easily and airily as intended. The five-part writing is, as it were, only a kind of enriched four-part writing.«²¹

20 Ibid.

21 Ibid., p. 256.

Einstein's urge to establish the influence of the French chanson is even more pronounced in his characterization of Arcadelt's work, and the extensive set-up to *Il bianco e dolce cigno* is entirely devoted to analyzing eight chansons, which is really remarkable in a book on the Italian madrigal. His account begins:

»Among the first three masters of the madrigal, Arcadelt is not only the most productive but also the most universal, since he cultivated the French chanson no less than the madrigal. In this he differed from Verdelot, by whom we have only a very few chansons which, because of their late publication, must be considered somewhat suspect. [...] Naturally enough, the bulk of Arcadelt's chansons falls into the years after 1549, when he was in France; none the less, a great many printed as early as 1540 or thereabouts by Attaingnant and Moderne must date from the same time as his Italian production. It is difficult to say whether Arcadelt the composer of chansons influenced Arcadelt the composer of madrigals, or vice versa. It is almost as difficult to determine in detail the interrelations of French and Italian culture before and after Charles VIII's expedition of conquest«.²²

Einstein takes as a first example *Voulant amour sous parler gracieux*, a classic expression of courtly love in the epigrammatic form so appreciated by chanson composers:

Voulant amour sous parler gracieux
 Porter son feu pour ton cœur enflammer,
 Il ressortit marri et furieux
 Car ton froid cœur il ne sçeut entamer,
 Alors picqué d'un despit trop amer
 Conclud brûler tout ce qui seroit tien,
 En que verrois consommer de tes yeux
 Moy par dedans et par dehors ton bien.

His objective is to reinforce his claims about the chanson-like quality of Verdelot's *Dormend'un giorno* with a chanson in the same poetic form, and his commentary draws a parallel between the Italian ottava set by Verdelot and Arcadelt's eight-line epigram in French: »When Verdelot sets a text like the ottava [...] *Dormend'un giorno*, the result is in ottava form a pseudo-classic epigrammatic anecdote of the sort so much in favor with the chanson, as for example [*Voulant amour*], set by Arcadelt«.²³

22 Ibid., p. 264.

23 Ibid., p. 264 f. Perhaps intentionally, Einstein selected the earliest known chanson of Arcadelt to come out in print. *Voulant amour sous parler gracieux* was published by Jacques Moderne in *Le pa-*

And yet, Arcadelt's own setting does not take its cue from the poetry, at least not if huitains are supposed to generate settings with the musical repeats and homophony Einstein calls out in *Dormend'un giorno*. Einstein could better have compared Verdelot's madrigal to a different one of Arcadelt's early epigrammatic chansons, *Au temps heureux que ma jeune ignorance*, which is much closer in kind, but sets twelve lines of text.²⁴ The partial analysis and faulty reasoning evident in Einstein's comparison reveals the extent to which he prefers poetic arguments over musical ones, not only with his famous frottola-into-madrigal thesis, but in comparisons of the madrigal and chanson as well.

National Character

After this opening gambit, Einstein examines half a dozen chanson texts in quick succession. Some exemplify the influence of the madrigal, such as *Quand je pense au martire* by Dominique Phinot, which sets a French translation of a madrigal by Pietro Bembo from the *Asolani*, »Quand'io pens'al martire« and was printed in Lyon in 1548.²⁵ Others are examples of »chansons which are typical madrigals in French« such as Arcadelt's *Amour me sçauries vous apprendre*, a strophic chanson setting a heterometric text by Mellin de Saint-Gelais.²⁶ Finally, Einstein presents another instance of madrigal verse cropping up in France in translation among Arcadelt's later works, *Qui veut du ciel et du [sic] nature*, which he identifies as »simply a paraphrase of Petrarch's sonnet ›Chi vuol veder quantunque può Natura,‹ minus Petrarch's depth and melancholy.«²⁷

rangon des chansons, Tiers livre contenant .xxvi. chansons nouvelle, Lyon 1538 and Pierre Attaingnant in the *Tiers livre contenant xxx. chansons vieilles esleues de plusieurs livres*, Paris 1538.

24 *Au temps heureux que ma jeune ignorance* was published by Attaingnant in the *Sixiesme livre contenant xxvii. chansons nouvelles a quatre parties*, Paris 1539.

25 *TLM*, p. 265.

26 *Amour me sçauries vous apprendre* was first printed by Le Roy & Ballard in the *Tiers livre de chansons, nouvellement mises en musique*, Paris 1554, not in 1569, as reported by Einstein. It is available in modern edition in *Jacobi Arcadelt Opera Omnia*, ed. Albert Seay, vol. 7, Chansons I, [Rome] 1968 (Corpus Mensuralis Musicae, 31), pp. 67 f. Stylistically, one could argue both sides of the case for it being madrigalesque. On the one hand, it is through composed, with touches of word painting (flat sonorities and suspension figures at »souspirs« in mm. 11–13 and falling semi-minim »tears« in m. 15). On the other, the texture is quite homophonic and sufficiently repetitive in its rhythmic formulas that it could also be likened to a frottola. This generic likeness is even more apparent in the version for voice and guitar printed by Le Roy & Ballard the same year in the *Cinquiesme livre de guiterre*, Paris 1554, fols. 22v–23r, in which the texted melody given in mensural notation is the tenor of the four-voice version transposed up an octave and cleffed g2 for soprano.

27 *TLM*, p. 266. *Qui veut du ciel & de nature* was printed by Le Roy & Ballard in the *Sisieme livre de chansons à quatre & cinq parties, de I. Arcadelt, & autres*, Paris 1569, fols. 5v–6r, with an attribution to Arcadelt.

That verdict – a paraphrase of Petrarch *minus Petrarch's depth and melancholy* (emphasis mine) – is worth lingering over, since it brings forward Einstein's earlier argument about rising literary standards and uses it in a new formulation concerning national style. Rather than seeking to distinguish chanson from madrigal based on the provenance of sources, cross-currents in local repertoires, and other critical approaches generally taken by musicologists, for Einstein, yet again, much comes down to the poetry.²⁸ The chanson lacks depth, and more specifically, the depth that Petrarch brought to the madrigal. This is not a matter of poetic form driving the composer's musical choices – as we have seen, Einstein is quick to liken Verdelot's setting of the ottava »Dormend'un giorno« to Arcadelt's setting of the huitain »Voulant amour« based on the outward form of the poetry. Here, the point illustrated by two more texts is that French chansons express a confusion of high and low sentiments in an un-Italian mixture of courtly love and open sexuality.

J'en ayme deux d'amour bien differente
 L'une me plait pour sa grace et bon sens;
 L'autre me monstre amour si apparente
 Que de l'aymer maugré moy je consens.
 Mais bien qu'à elle obligé je me sente,
 Plus a donné à l'autre je me sens.
 O, que les deux eussent mesme vouloir,
 Ou que de l'une il me peut moins chaloir!

[I love two in contrasting ways
 One delights me with her grace and sensibility;
 The other displays such affection
 That I adore her despite myself.
 But even though I feel to her pledged,
 I feel compelled to offer more of myself to the other.

28 A contrasting analytic approach is modeled, for instance, by Lawrence F. Bernstein, »Notes on the Origin of the Parisian Chanson«, *Journal of Musicology* 1 (1982), pp. 275–326, who works across a variety of materials in his study of the chanson in Italy. He observes, for instance, that »four-part arrangements of the homorhythmic type were first composed in Italy in the late 1480s and 1490s and that the style remained in vogue there until the mid-1520s. Conversely, although the new type chanson [which Einstein characterizes as infiltrating Italy from abroad] seems to have been known in France, we have no evidence of its widespread popularity there, or that it persisted in France as long and durably as it did in Italy« (p. 299); and »the lyrical Parisian chanson style can be traced from its embryonic stage to a relatively sophisticated stylistic level in selected four-voice chansons drawn from French and Italian sources of the period 1504–15« (p. 309). Fenlon and Haar, *The Italian Madrigal*, p. 16, note that one flaw in Einstein's study is its neglect of manuscript sources, which feature centrally in Bernstein's study.

Oh, that the two would have the same dispositions
Or that from one I could feel less passion.]

»We look in vain in the madrigal«, Einstein says, »for a motif so genuinely Gallic as that of the double amour, of which Arcadelt supplies this example.«²⁹ Confronted by this middle ground of a seductive mistress and a love triangle, Einstein draws a firm line. His editorial inclusion of a final exclamation point not found in the original says it all: be shocked by this bald expression of love as hot sex! Initially, I found Einstein's slightly scandalized tone surprising and paused to check my own reaction to it, but his next example doubles down on the characterization of the French as free-loving and having sex at every turn. He continues:

Nor do we find in the madrigal a four-line stanza of such natural and realistic grace as the genuinely Gallic counsel:

Qui veult aimer il fault estre joyeux,
Et aller veoir sa dame souveraine
Deux ou trois fois ou quatre la sepmaine,
Pour en avoir ung baiser graticulx—

printed among Arcadelt's three-part madrigals (1542) under the name of Jacotin. Presumably this Jacotin is not the highly dubious Jacotin of the lexicons and bibliographies, but Jacques Arcadelt himself.³⁰

I will turn to the text of *Qui veult aimer* in a moment, but first it is important to set the record straight concerning the authorship of this setting, since there is no reason to presume that the attribution to Jacotin is some sort of coy ascription to Arcadelt, whose identity is hidden behind the diminutive of his first name. *Qui vault aimer il fault estre joyeux* has a rich history in print that includes the three-voice setting attributed to Jacotin by Antoine Gardano in the *Primo libro di madrigali d'Archadelt a tre voci, insieme alcuni di Const. Fest. Con la gionta di dodese canzoni francese et sei motteti novissimi* (Venice, 1542) as well as an earlier setting by Adrian Willaert printed in *La Couronne et fleur des chansons a troys* (Venice, 1536), and a six-voice canonic setting ascribed to Willaert and printed by Tielman Susato in *Le treziesme livre contenant vingt et deux chansons nouvelles a six et a huyt parties* (Antwerp, 1550). The two Willaert settings share motivic material

29 *J'en ayme deux d'amour bien differente* was printed by Le Roy & Ballard in the *Tiers livre de chansons nouvellement composé à quatre parties par M. Arcadet & autres auteurs*, Paris 1567, fols. 14v–15r, with an attribution to Arcadelt; translation by Nicholas Manjoine.

30 *TIM*, p. 266.

present in the Tenor of Jacotin's setting, which suggests that all might be based on a pre-existent tune. Frank Dobbins, who edited the setting cited by Einstein, does not question the attribution to Jacotin, which remained consistent in all four reprintings (RISM 1543²¹, 1559²¹, 1574³, 1587⁸).³¹

Dobbins provides the following translation, which mirrors the enclosed rhymes of the original with »joy« and »coy« in English and in this way underscores the coyness or false modesty masking the double potential of the »baiser gracieux«. For the thrill of the poem turns on the double entendre in which, already in the sixteenth century, the noun »baiser« – »action de poser ses lèvres sur le visage, la main ou sur une partie du corps d'une personne« (i.e., a kiss) – is identical to the verb »baiser«: »posséder sexuellement (qqn)« (i.e., to have sex with someone).³²

He who would love should be [so] full of joy,
And his lady sovereign [more often] seek,
Two or three times or four [times] every week
To have from her a kiss gracious [and coy].

Einstein's false ascription of *Qui veult aimer il fault estre joyeux* to Arcadelt allows him to present the chanson at this point in his narrative, where he is charting the interconnections between chanson and madrigal in Arcadelt's œuvre, but then, having done so, he feels compelled to add a little fig leaf to the story to protect Arcadelt's modesty.

This long detour into chanson verse and Einstein's multiple examples is no rabbit hole, far from it. Its purpose is to clarify a foundational difference between chanson and madrigal based on national character: the French throw together songs that are courtly, light, anecdotal, and obscene, all within one and the same generic framework, while the Italians maintain a sharp distinction between the madrigal and its expressive other, the villanella, which can be »crude to the point of vulgarity«.

The chanson knows nothing like the sharp distinction between madrigal and villanella. There is a lyrico-sentimental and a gay, anecdotal, and obscene chanson – both however within one and the same framework. Madrigal and villanella are on the other hand diametrically opposed, though neither one is thinkable without the other.³³

31 See Jacotin, *Chansons*, ed. Frank Dobbins, Turnhout 2004 (Épitome musical), p. xlii (critical commentary and translation) and p. 97 f. (music). Dobbins argues convincingly that the Jacotin named as the composer of chansons and cited in chapel registers as Jacotino Frontino, Jacques Frontin, Jacotin Le bel, and Jacobo Level were a single individual, *ibid.*, pp. ix–xii.

32 See »baiser«, *Le Grand Robert de la langue française* (Version numérique [2005–]), ed. Laurent Catach, Alain Rey, Danièle Morvan, Laurence Laporte and Paul Robert, Paris 2011.

33 *TIM*, p. 266.

At this point, Einstein's discomfort with generic mixture reveals its more radical implications as a critique of French cultural norms and ethnic identity. It also reinforces a false distinction at the heart of *The Italian Madrigal* between high and low in Italian vernacular repertoires. Iain Fenlon and Richard Wistreich put it well in the *Cambridge History of Sixteenth-Century Music* when they call out Einstein's magnum opus for having created the genre of the Italian madrigal as »an ontological entity« by effectively imposing this label on »a vast body of different kinds of musical materials, coagulating them into a single genre and a unitary narrative [that] remains largely unchallenged«. ³⁴ Meanwhile, they continue, »sub-classes of the otherwise »serious« madrigal, such as canzone alla napolitana, which could not be ignored thanks to their ubiquity in printed sources, are dealt with by isolating them within a separate chapter«. ³⁵

What a feat of determination, to produce a multi-genre, multilingual analysis that nonetheless arrives at a clearly segregated configuration. In the end, when language and musical style prove insufficient to distinguish between chanson and madrigal, Einstein invokes Gallic culture and sexuality. It is admittedly difficult to know what he meant by »Gallic«, writing as a displaced German-Jewish musicologist in the second third of the twentieth century. If it was intended as a comment about French courtiership in the early sixteenth century, perhaps he was referring to the French practice of recognizing official royal mistresses such as Diane de Poitiers (mistress of Henry II) as »maîtresses en titre«. But it seems equally likely that Einstein's offhand comments channel early twentieth-century German commonplaces that characterized the French as decadent, over-sexed (yet unproductive), and falling behind in the contest with Germany for industrial and military domination. ³⁶ Only a thorough intellectual and cultural biography of Einstein and his work might begin to provide answers. For the moment, raising these questions is a reminder that *The Italian Madrigal* is a period piece, one that should be read as a historical document deeply entangled in its historical moment, a time of social catastrophe across Europe, in Berlin, London, and Tuscany. The history of this book is probably inseparable from the broader histories of Fascism, World War II, the Holocaust, and the forced migrations induced by them. It certainly cannot be separated from the nationalism writ large across its pages. ³⁷ Its vocabulary of

34 Richard Wistreich, »Introduction«, *The Cambridge History of Sixteenth-Century Music*, ed. Iain Fenlon and Richard Wistreich, Cambridge 2019, p. 6.

35 Ibid.

36 See Michael E. Nolan, *The Inverted Mirror: Mythologizing the Enemy in France and Germany, 1898–1914*, New York 2005, pp. 55–62.

37 On Italian musicology and nationalism during the time of Mussolini, see Fenlon, »Malipiero, Monteverdi, Mussolini and Musicology«. Although Fenlon does not mention Einstein or discuss the relationship between *The Italian Madrigal* and Italian nationalism of the 1930s, he does un-

indigeneity and native composers and their struggle against foreign incursions – these imaginings of Italy regaining autochthonous purity have little to do with the sixteenth century and more to do with the modern ideologies of ethnic heritage that were mobilized to consolidate Italian and German identities under Fascism.

*

These days, now that migration and cultural mobility are widely acknowledged as endemic to early modern Europe, we have new critical tools for understanding the complexities Einstein was confronting seventy years ago at a time when national historiographies exerted such a profound influence on studies of both vernacular literature and secular music. Back in the mid-twentieth century, genre was keyed to essentialized understandings of language, nation, and ethnicity. We now know, however, that Verdelot and Arcadelt were not unique, that many musicians travelled great distances, and vernacular repertoires regularly took root well outside the bounds of the modern nation-states to which they are regularly assigned.³⁸ Had Einstein written his study of *The Italian Madrigal* today, I suspect that with his vast knowledge of vernacular song repertoires, multiple linguistic footings, and his own transculturality, he would have had much to contribute to the historiographic reframing that is reshaping how we understand the music of early modern Europe.

derscore the importance of Germany as a place where Italians studied musicology: Giacomo Benvenuti (1885–1943) studied musical philology in Munich with Adolf Sandberger, and Gaetano Cesari (1870–1934) studied paleography with Theodor Kroyer, music history with Sandberger, and wrote a doctoral dissertation on the origins of the Italian madrigal that was published in German in 1908 (ibid., pp. 250–252).

38 See e.g. the *Prosopographie des chantres de la Renaissance*, <https://ricercar.pcr.cesr.univ-tours.fr>, a database of the biographies of professional singers who worked in European chapels from 1350–1600 that allows users to track their career moves from place to place. For an overview of recent collective projects on the subject of music and migration in early modern Europe, see Kate van Orden, »Introduction: Music and Mobility«, *Seachanges. Music in the Mediterranean and Atlantic Worlds, 1550–1800*, ed. eadem, Cambridge, MA 2022 (I Tatti Research Series, 2), pp. 9–30: pp. 9 and 27.

Abkürzungen

<i>DIM</i>	Alfred Einstein, <i>Das italienische Madrigal. Versuch einer Geschichte der italienischen Profanmusik des 16. Jahrhunderts</i> , hrsg. von Sebastian Bolz, München 2025 (Münchener Veröffentlichungen zur Musikgeschichte, 83), DOI: 10.5282/ubm/epub.128701
<i>DDT</i>	<i>Denkmäler deutscher Tonkunst</i> , hrsg. von Rochus von Liliencron u. a., Leipzig 1892–1931
<i>DTB</i>	<i>Denkmäler der Tonkunst in Bayern</i> , hrsg. von Adolf Sandberger, Leipzig 1900–1920, Augsburg 1924–1938 (Denkmäler deutscher Tonkunst, Zweite Folge); Neue Folge (N. F.), Wiesbaden 1962 ff.
<i>DTÖ</i>	<i>Denkmäler der Tonkunst in Österreich</i> , hrsg. von Guido Adler u. a., Wien 1894 ff.
<i>Grove Music Online</i>	<i>Grove Music Online</i> , hrsg. von Laura Macy, fortgesetzt von Deane L. Root, Oxford 2001 ff.
<i>LexM</i>	<i>Lexikon verfolgter Musiker und Musikerinnen der NS-Zeit</i> , hrsg. von Claudia Maurer Zenck u. a., Hamburg 2005 ff., https://www.lexm.uni-hamburg.de/
<i>MGG Online</i>	<i>Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart Online</i> , hrsg. von Laurenz Lütteken, Kassel u. a. 2016 ff.
<i>PäM</i>	<i>Publikationen älterer Musik</i> , hrsg. von Theodor Kroyer, Leipzig 1926–1940
<i>TIM</i>	Alfred Einstein, <i>The Italian Madrigal</i> , übers. von Alexander H. Krappe, Roger Sessions und Oliver Strunk, Princeton 1949

Zitate aus *Das italienische Madrigal* / *The Italian Madrigal* erfolgen in der Regel in der Sprache und Ausgabe des jeweiligen Aufsatzes. Im Sinne dieses Bandes, dem es um eine Re-Lektüre unter den Bedingungen von Original und Übersetzung geht, werden entsprechende Stellen bei Bedarf in den Fußnoten in der jeweils anderen Sprache wiedergegeben.

Sämtliche im Band enthaltenen Links wurden zuletzt überprüft am 14.03.2025.